

Recognising Value Based Approach In Corporate Governance: Institutionalization Of Ethics

Zaleha Othman and Rashidah Abd Rahman

Corporate governance is the structure used to direct and manage business and affairs of the company towards enhancing prosperity and corporate accountability. However, for decade's argument on the inadequacy of corporate governance mechanism to cope with the modern corporations seem to hit the business agenda. Several views indicate that the principle based governance designed to direct and manage business could not cope with the globalization era. The purpose of this paper is to propose fundamental element to fill the inadequacy - incorporating value based approach into corporate governance practices. This paper argues that value based approach form of corporate governance practices need to be introduced to support the present corporate governance practices framework. Hence, this paper will discuss the ethics aspects of governance focusing on formalization of ethics in organization as a mechanism to improve governance practices. A single case study was conducted to explore the ethical mechanisms that have been institutionalized in order to enhance corporate governance practices. Interview was performed with relevant key person in the company. Based on the interviews conducted several ethical mechanism were discovered in order to enhance better governance in the corporation. This paper contributes towards new perspective of governance whereby the ethical aspects is integrated into the governance practices.

Field of research: ethics, corporate governance

1. Introduction

Corporate governance is a topic which is often discussed and debated upon in recent years. Although the issue of corporate governance has been discussed since the early days of corporations, the interest on corporate governance seems to take the attention of the media and the public soon after the giant corporate scandals such as *Enron*, *WorldCom* etc. Due to its economic impact, these corporate malpractices spark the crisis of trust among the stakeholders. Subsequently, realizing the important of governance issues, regulators in various countries including Malaysia provides various perspectives for governance reforms.

Othman & Rahman

Prof. Rashidah Abd Rahman, Faculty of Accountancy, University Technology MARA, Malaysia email: shidah@salam.uitm.edu.my

As a moved to rebuild the trust on the governance systems, initiative on improving the corporate governance systems has been formulated world wide. Proactive measures have been taken by the regulators to put forward recommendations and regulations on corporate governance. Continuous efforts developed simply to guide corporations into achieving necessary high standards of corporate behavior.

However, the trend of corporate scandals keeps emerging, which raise the questions towards the credibility of corporate governance system. Some claims that the present corporate governance mechanism neglect fundamental element (Coffee, 2003). Reviewing the literatures, it is also noted that the current corporate governance mechanism has its limitation. The purpose of this paper is to propose fundamental element to fill the limitation - incorporating value based approach into corporate governance practices. This paper argues that value based approach form of corporate governance practices need to be introduced to support the present corporate governance practices framework. Value based approach is necessary to cope with the advancement of business conduct in this era. Hence, this paper will discuss the ethics aspects of governance focusing on formalization of ethics in organization as a mechanism to improve governance practices. A single case study was conducted to explore the ethical instruments that have been institutionalized in order to enhance corporate governance practices. Hence, this paper focus on the various ethical instruments present in the company selected. In essence, this paper contribute towards advancement of knowledge in governance as it put forward the important element (that is ethics), which is recognized as fundamental to circumvent corporate governance flaws by several researchers (Arjon, 2005; MacKenzie, 2004, Oon, 2004).

The remainder of the paper is organized as follows: The next section discusses the relevant literature on issues pertaining to institutionalizing ethics and its importance in governance practices. The third section explains the research method followed by a discussion on the findings. The paper ends with conclusion and the limitation of the research in addition to suggestion for future research.

2. Literature Review

Concentration on corporate governance research has been mainly dealt in the decision making of board. Although, implementation of the decision making is important, accomplishing the four pillar of corporate governance that is accountability, transparency, fairness and responsibilities are core values in every decision making in a corporations are precedence. Good governance as described by Quinsumbing (2007) is formal and informal decision making and the process of which the decision is made. Therefore, good governance structure should possess characteristic such as participatory, consensus oriented, accountable, transparent, responsive, effective, and efficient, inclusive and follow the rule of law (Quinsumbing, 2007). The key challenges

Othman & Rahman

of modern corporations, however is to accomplish these values at the same time maintain the sustainability of the corporations.

Due to the constants news of corporate misconduct, perception on the corporate governance structure has somewhat been depressing. The compliance based approach of governance structure has been claim insufficient in coping with the challenges of modern business (Arjoon, 2005). Consequently, companies find themselves pressured to meet stakeholders demand for accountability and transparency. Typified by the agency theory where the wealth of stakeholders is made priority, corporations seem to focus on compliance rather than the substance of the governance practices. Profit driven motivation of achieving the wealth for stakeholders are not on top of the list in investors view because investors focus more on sustaining the growth of business in the globalization era. Thus, globalization has driven corporations to act ethically or confront with the consequences of losing their support from stakeholders.

Bring to the fore, integrating ethics as a new approach towards better governance has been viewed important. This is due to the many suggestions made by governance scholars that ethics is the core concept in corporate governance (e.g. Caldwell & Karri, 2005; Sullivan & Shkolnikov, 2007). Businesses have responsibility towards the society, therefore answerable to the society. As emphasized by the social institution theory, a corporation is not merely a private association created for the purpose of personal enrichment but also a public enterprise that is intended to serve some larger social good (McEwan, 2001). Hence, ethical behavior is the social responsibility of corporations to protect the society in which they operate (Fisher, 2004). Fisher (2004) further adds that the responsibility of corporation is a set of obligations the corporations has to protect in a society in which they function.

Several opinions has been gathered to claim that integrating ethics value in an organization could prevent corporate mishap and thus safeguard the individual and corporate reputations (Drennan, 2004). Infusion of ethics principles and values into corporate culture often been emerged in the boardroom discussion. Fombrun and Foss (2004) highlight the three principles which often emerged in the discussion among the board that are: infusion of ethic principles and values into corporate culture, appointment of chief ethics officers, adoption of stricter ethical guidelines and codes of conduct.

2.1 Institutionalized of ethics

One of the views of infusing value based approach of governance is through institutionalization of ethics. Several ethic researcher claims that institutionalization of ethics is a formal initiatives to guide the member of an organization in making ethical decision (Weber, 1981; Hoffman, Moore & Fedo, 1983). Empirical evidence in the 1980's and 1990's has proven on the point that institutionalization of ethics is a form that have been incorporate in organization to direct corporations towards ethical decision making. (i.e. Stevens, 1994; Vitell and Hidalgo, 2006). But what is institutionalization of ethics? There are several views on the understanding of

Othman & Rahman

institutionalization of ethics. Andrew (1989), for example, defined institutionalization of ethics as the action that are needed to map a high road to economic and ethical performance and to mount guardrails to keep corporate wayfarers on track' (p.99 as cited in Soutar, McNeil & Molster, 1995). Purcell and Weber (1976: 6), on the other hand, defined it as

'... institutionalizing ethics may sound ponderous, but its meaning is straightforward. It means getting ethics formally and explicitly into daily business life. It means getting ethics into company policy formation at the board and top management levels and through a formal code, getting ethics into all daily decision making and work practices down the line, at all levels of employment. It means grafting a new branch on the corporate decision tree- a branch that reads "right/ wrong".'

Purcell and Weber (1979) suggested that companies should adopted institutionalization of ethics to impose good strategy in companies. Recent opinion on institutionalization of ethics has been viewed in Vitell and Hidalgo (2006) where, it has been identify as an important route to control the problem of ethical issues in organizations. Institutionalization of ethics explores how organization structure and action are molded by cultural, political and social forces that surround the entity (Fogarty, 1995). This organization structure and action are important as the action which does not instill with values, may lose the support of the institutions actors. This is because; the environment surrounded the organizations dictate that organizational survival is predicated upon some form of conformity to prevail values or standards for appropriate behavior. As pointed by Fogarty (1995), institutional theory provides an ability to allow for the separation of the rhetoric of ethics and ethical action.

Soutar et al. (1995) explained that institutionalization of ethics keeps the employees of an organization guided by formal ethics element to matters relate with ethical concerns. This formal guideline is indeed important as has been noted in McEwan (2001) that ethics is an important element in decision making process in an organization. Institutionalization of ethics would help in decision making in an organization because it is a form of consistent set of value that would guide employees in their conduct of doing business. Soutar et al. (1995) in their study reveal that there are three factors to institutionalized ethics in an organization which are: internalization of ethical values, compliance with rules, and external perceptions. In their study of institutionalization of ethics in Western Australia Stock Exchange companies listed in main and second board, Soutar et al. (1995) found that forty eight percent of these listed companies have institutionalize ethics in their workplace. As for the factor contribute to companies taken formal step to incorporate ethics values, it is reveal in their study that size is a factor that explain the interest to institutionalize ethics in these public listed companies. Larger companies (with employees between 1000-5000) have formally incorporated ethics however; the smaller companies (less than 100 employees) had undertaken the initiatives. Sourtar et al. (1995) also found that there are several reasons for companies not taken initiatives to institutionalized ethics in their organization process, which are company is ethical enough, company too small to need it, lack of time to plan such efforts, and lack of financial resources. It is also discovered that the major pushing factors are more of external purposes as the main reason was to provide direction to

Othman & Rahman

employees and to be seen as socially responsible and to improve corporate image. Nevertheless, the internal pushing factors that describe and improve management behavior and corporate culture, compliance with law and the reduction of criminal activity in the workplace.

Sims (1991) in his suggestion described several elements which could be institutionalized within organizations. Permanent board-level committee, code of ethics, ethics training are some of the ways to institutionalize ethics in an organization apart from managing the psychological contract between its employees and the organizations, reinforcing the employee's organizational commitment, and encouraging an ethically-oriented organizational culture. In addition, Jose and Thibodeaux (1999) conducted a study of 86 corporate level marketing and human resources managers of American multi-national corporations. It found that the implicit forms of institutionalizing ethics are more effective than the explicit forms in shaping the ethical behavior.

It is also revealed that institutionalization of ethics such as ethical program could provide a difference in governance practices in a corporation. Felo (2001), for example, although found that there is no significant relation between the potential conflict corporate governance structures in firms with ethics program and without ethics programs, however firms in which boards are actively involved in the oversight of the programs have more independent boards than firms in which the board is not involved in the programs. As a matter of fact, a recent study conducted by Integrity Interactive Europe concluded that robust ethics and compliance programs are the major concern for business across Europe. Implementing ethics and compliance programs are among the top reasons chosen by the heads of legal and chief compliance offices of 500 largest companies for doing the right thing and building a common company culture. Needless to say, the trend of institutionalization of ethics continues as companies realize the benefits of infusing ethics in business activities. Companies take initiatives to include and improvise the ethical mechanism to attract particular interest groups towards the companies as it is believed being a responsible member is rewarding.

The following section of the paper explains the outcome of a case study conducted by the researcher to investigate the mechanism used for institutionalizing ethics in enhancing corporate governance practices.

3. Research Method

A single exploratory case study was conducted for the purpose of exploring the ethics mechanism in the company towards the practices of good governance. The case was selected based on criteria where; the company is listed among the best ten companies that are ranked to have obtained high corporate governance scores in the 2006 corporate governance survey conducted by Minority Shareholders Watchdog Group and Nottingham University Malaysia. Based on the suggestion made by Ritchie and Lewis (2003), that unit for sample chosen due to the characteristic that is expected or known to have salience to the subject matter under study, in other words, 'symbolic

representation' due to its relevant to the investigation of the study, the company is selected.

3.1 Description of the case

The description of the case is restricted for the purpose of confidentiality. Hence, the name of the company would not be disclosed. However, basic information of the study will be described. The study was conducted in one of the leading communication corporations in Malaysia. It started as a private company but has been listed in the Bursa Malaysia for several years. The company is well established for its innovative service provider and has received several domestic and international awards. This company grew rapidly due to the demand of communication technology. The selection of the company was based on the criteria that the company is among the top ten (out of 350 companies listed in the survey) that had been accounted as companies practicing the highest level of corporate governance compliance in accordance with the Bursa Malaysia Securities Berhad corporate governance and best principle. The rank on the level of compliance was based from a joint study by the University of Nottingham and the Malaysian Shareholder Watchdog Group (2007) related with corporate governance.

3.2 Design of research

An exploratory case study is appropriate to describe the research strategy. The exploratory fits in the design because at this stage, this study mainly focus on 'what' questions which as described by (Yin, 1994) justify the rationale for conducting an exploratory study. In this sense, the present study aims at exploring 'what' and 'how' the company use ethical mechanism that could enhance its corporate governance practices. In order to answer the inquiry: what are the instrument used to in calculate ethical conduct in improving corporate governance practices, the research procedure follow the inquiry method. Discovering what is the 'truth' out there is the key issue of the research design. Hence, based on the nature of the study (i.e. exploration of ethics), face to face interview is appropriate technique. Interview was conducted with the head of internal auditor. The head of internal auditor was selected due to his scope of work where any ethical issue and concerns is the responsibility in his unit. The interviews were recorded on tape, but in some cases notes were taken. The tapes were subsequently transcribed. In addition, prior to the interviews, public documents and the corporate websites were observed. The information gathered from these sources used to validate the information during interview process. Documents such as the annual reports were used as source of evidence. Themes were then identified from the transcription, document analysis and a summary of result drafted.

However, the result cannot be generalized as the study is conducted in a single company. Nonetheless, it is not the intention of this study at this stage, to generalize the findings as the main aim is to explore the nature of the reality. The intention of the qualitative study is to form interpretation of the phenomenon; thus the subject of generalization will not be an issue. The case is based on particularistic means where

the focus is on a particular situation, event or phenomenon (Merriam, 1998). In this case the criterion is based on exploring the ethical aspects of governance that had been practiced in this company. This study indeed selects case company that is well known for its ethical stance and has been rated among the top ten of high ranked corporate governance practices in 2006. Based on this single case, the results inform the knowledge about the nature of being and reality in this particular setting. Patterns of meaning, understand and definition of situation is basis suggested by Grbich (2007) in exploration of qualitative research that has been fulfilled. Instead of reporting the findings in numerical data, this case study used categories of theme to illustrate the represented reality.

4. Findings and Discussion

Based on the interviews transcribed, several themes related with institutionalization of ethics as being possibly influencing the corporate governance practices were discovered. Some of the themes are directly concerned with the formal structure of the company whilst others are more of views of the respondent. Based on the data gathered, the data were later broken into themes. These themes are:

4.1 Committees and committee members

The respondent pointed several ethics structure that is practiced in the company. One of the main initiatives towards good governance practices is that the company formed a "Defalcation Committee". It is a committee that is set up to deliberate all conflict cases related with ethical issues. The members of "Defalcation Committee" are the Chief Finance Officer, Director of Human Resource, General Council and Chief Operating Officer. The purpose of forming this committee is to listen and make decision upon any individual who had violated the ethical conduct based on the report made by the Internal Audit Department. Disciplinary act will be taken upon the individual based of severity of the cases which has been brought on by the Internal Audit investigation and report. This committee will meet once in every six weeks to update on the cases reported by the Internal Audit Department. The decision of "Defalcation Committee" is taken seriously by the company.

4.2 Criteria for directors appointment

Another means of enhancing good governance is setting criteria for appointment of directors. The respondent pointed the company formulated additional criteria for selection of directors; where the appointment of director should be beyond their qualification. He strongly believed that directors of a corporation should not be restricted to skills and knowledge. Malaysian Code of Corporate Governance (Report on Malaysia Code of Corporate Governance, 1999) recommended that board should make up of combination of directors who has intimate knowledge of the business. However, the Code does not emphasis that the credibility of board members in terms of their recognized integrity and credibility. The company however, emphasizes additional

Othman & Rahman

criteria which the respondent find important in enhancing standard of corporate governance practices. Apart from director's skills and knowledge, the person's appointed should be of high reputation and integrity. As mentioned by him, this criterion is applied in the company understudy. Selection of directors for the said company is based on their reputation and integrity stand point. He explained the credibility of all twelve members of the board. Majority of the board members had experience in prestigious international companies with high business reputation. The board of director line up is mainly persons with high integrity and re-known business person. He views that Malaysia has long way to go in terms of the board members reputation and contribution towards the governance practices as Malaysian environment may be dominated by the founder and family which probably not in the position to contribute the best to the business. He stress that shareholders should be more vocal in terms of selection of directors.

4.3 Promotion of ethics

There are various ways that are practiced in the company in order to promote ethical conduct among the staff, board members and employees of the company. Below are several ethical instruments that are gathered based on the interview?

4.3.1 Code of conduct and business practices

"Ethics is core value of the company, on top of company satisfaction and culture"; statement pointed by the respondent. Ethics is one value that is considered as a core practiced in promoting and communicating good behavior in the company. He voiced that the company do not tolerate unethical behavior with any parties related to the company. The key manifesto of the company is to operate its business fairly, ethically and in full compliance with all laws and regulations. In order to make belief the manifesto, the company has created a detailed Code of Business Practices guideline for all the relevant internal and external parties. This Code of Business stipulates how each relevant individual should react and behave in line with the expectation of the company good governance practices. For example, every employee of the company must reach understand and sign the code of business practice every year, this more than 10 pages document that lay down precisely what company standard for; regard principle of ethics down to the detail of what given or gift, that they can be received and not received or procurement and delivery with contractor or member of the staff. Those are being sign once a year to remind people of values practice in the company. The practices in not restricted to employee, as a matter of fact, other relevant parties involved in the company are also bound by their ethics instrument. The company also formulated a vendor's code of business practices. The vendor codes consist of practices that are expected from vendors and the guidelines that are formulate by the company in order to main certain standard of integrity from both parties (the company and the vendor). "All company doing business must also sign on code of business practice, where they seek to communicate our principal of

Othman & Rahman

doing business and they are written reading and acknowledging they are being understood. Vendor, who found to be working against this ethics, would be discontinued from doing business with us". This explained by the respondent, is the entry point for external perception doing business with the company.

In regards to the implementation and effectiveness of the code, the company has specially established office of Business Practices to provide policy guidance and facilitate compliance with the code. Continuously efforts are taken by the office of Business Practice to look into ways to enhance high standard of business conduct and ethics in the company such as benchmark for best practices is observed to further improvise the company business practices.

4.3.2 Ethics Hot line

Further instrument disclosed by the respondent in promoting ethics is that the company created ethics hotline. In order to maintain the integrity of the hotline and the confidentiality of the subject, an independent unit is mandated to hold the trust of the hotline. Hence, internal audit, being the internal independent department is the custodian of the hotline. The purpose of appointing internal audit unit as custodian is because the staff would have higher confident to report through email or letter of any wrong doing instead of directly report to the top management. Staff in this company normally have full confident to report to the internal audit without fear.

4.3.3 Other sources

We have internal control web whereby all employee can get access. It is a program on internal control, case study and part of ethics. The is a section called "ask dr control" where the employee can ask any enquiry related to internal control, risk management and any ethics issue. That is one training using virtual reality that is easily accessible and provides quick answer for the employee to resolve their conflict or query related to ethical issue. In addition, on entry point, every new staff is given training related to ethical conflict. Thus, would guide them to deal with ethical problem or issues in future. Some of the staff such as the management manager and the engineer are given training known as management attachment program where they are trained from six to twelfth month. This attachment program nurtures them to be ethical manager and be better in internal control.

4.4 Behavioral development

Employees are constantly encouraged to attend programmed such as 'effective people program'. Such programme are developed to enhance their management skill. The company provides change programmed initiatives to facilitate the mindset and behavioral change to realize the company long term vision target. The aim of establishing the change programmed is to establish the company reputation and to

Othman & Rahman

sustain the company value proposition. The company also revamped their performance appraisal system to incorporate performance indicator on behavior and mindset change. This is a good move made by the company to instill good behavior among employees in ensuring continuous permeation of the culture across all aspects of the company business.

4.5 Leadership extracts the culture

The respondent believed that the company is run professionally as the leaders are of professional managers. He explained each individual senior board team with great admiration. Observing the members description, the quality of board members is indeed disputable as their various background, culture and nationality of the board members indicate the professionalism of the company. This is an advantage of the company to possess mix talent from outside and within Malaysia. As mentioned by the respondent, all of the board members have a good track record. They are highly regarded individual in the business society. Majority are from reputable multi national corporations. As stressed by him, *“basically we get the best people around. Their background is strong so when they go to board meeting they can contribute”*. The respondent voiced that the corporate governance survey on disclosure of best practices although good, has its limitation. This is because the measurement does not measure the internal part of the company for example the reputation of the leaders. He foresees that the missing element which is very important for investors is not disclosed in the Annual Report. The missing element could not be prescribed in the statement of corporate governance but culturally cultivate by the leaders in the company. It has strong business fundamental and culture of innovation. Highly qualified individual are trusted to carry out this culture of innovation. What they stand for? Who represent the leadership? Who are they? Observing the annual report, the company provides quite an extensive description of each individual board member including their experience. The board shows good example to the employee by themselves attending training programmers such as in-house training to develop their leadership qualities and managerial capabilities.

4.6 Internal ethics policy

The procedure related to ethical concerns especially business conduct such as receiving gifts are well documented in the company. For example, they have a declaration form to be filled in for anyone who received gift worth more than RM200. The application will be approved by ethics officers who will decide on whether the gift should be returned or otherwise.

4.7 Formalized communication

The company also believes in communicating ethics values from top to bottom. This is done through program where the code in business practice is communicated to the staff. How this is done? Every new recruit to this company spend first week in orientation program where the code in business practice is explained. The objective of the program is to ensure new recruits understand the practices of business conduct in

Othman & Rahman

the company and respect the expectation of the company towards ethical behavior. In order to bind their responsibility, accountability and duties, the recruits have to sign code of business practice in their first week of employment.

Another form of communicating ethics is through means of disclosure of cases of wrong doing occurred in the company. In order to maintain ethic as core value practice in the company, the company communicate formally to the employee by verbally or formally inform them of the misconduct that has happened in the company.

“Every years I summaries all the investigation and communicated this with the staff verbally and in the Internal audit control bulletin. I publish this and tell the staff during the year and investigation 14 cases in a year. These cases are like falsification of documents, breach of document practices.”

Punishment for those who violate the ethical stance of the company is a message to the others that the company practice high standard of ethical conduct.

4.8 Internal audit involvement

Internal audit department in the company plays a key role in the institutionalization of ethics towards good governance. The internal audit department educate through various means in order to teach the staff with several tips of wrong doing such as recognizing red flag. Unlike other internal audit department in other company, the board recognized the important role of internal audit in enhancing ethical behavior among employees and enhancing governance practices in the company. Internal audit department in the company is very active not only in investigation but managing corporate governance and internal control issue. As a matter of fact, the head of audit is the member of the senior management team to ensure good corporate.

4.9 Enforcement

Implementation is an important aspect in ensuring best practices. ‘Walk the talk’ is a motto that should be practice in any organization. Essential to maintain the business reputation, the company formatted several strategies to ensure good governance practices. Defalcation Committee is one initiate taken by the company deal with regulatory on matters pertaining to fraud and unethical practices. The Committee works with Internal Audit Department and Management to act upon any cases of wrong doing. Hence, appropriate action is taken up by the committee upon the findings of the investigation. A fraud management function is also formed to safeguard the interest of the customers. Fraud management function is a monitoring unit that monitor the daily subscriber call pattern to recognize suspected call fraud which uses the industry development system to detect such wrong doing activities. Remedial action are taken and proposed to the management to ensure enforcement are taken seriously regarding any unethical behavior to protect the interest in this case the stakeholders.

5. Conclusion

Othman & Rahman

The key aspect of this study was to explore the possibility of ethical instrument to improve corporate governance practices. This involved focusing much on the ethical artifact that are integrate in a company in improving governance practices. Empirical evidence gathered based on this single case study found that institutionalization of ethics in the corporate governance practices structure would contribute towards different spectrum of governance. The study which explored how ethics concerns can be integrated in the corporate governance structure in an organization provide new insight of governance. Ethics instruments that have been formalized would help to implement high standards of governance in a corporation. Such approach provides evidence of the corporation commitment to good corporate governance practices. This study would contribute to a new dimension in understanding governance in the Malaysian context. The integration of the social element is indeed important as it could influence the corporation performance in terms of extensiveness, quality, quantity and comprehensive reporting by the corporation thus providing a new spectrum to the accounting scope. . Additionally, the corporate ethics concept explored could suggest for the generation of further study in the field of accounting and management. This study is potentially useful for parties, such as practitioners, to adopt the instrument recognized towards better governance mechanism in their organization. The corporate ethics artifacts discovered from the findings could be useful for organization to formalize ethics in order to achieve better governance results. The findings also hold potentially important implication to the regulators as this study is expected to yield valuable information that could be used to initiate further initiatives by regulators to develop and formulate an 'inclusion based approach' of corporate governance in Malaysia. In sum, this study will offer a way forward in understanding the prospects of corporate governance in Malaysia which is developing into a 'self-regulatory approach' and moving towards value based nexus of governance. This self-regulation approach contributed by the research findings would support and be a moral guide to the inadequacy of common regulatory based approach.

6. Limitation and future research

The present study has scoped its exploration of the issue focusing on a single case study. The frame is primarily within a particular setting of an organization. Thus, the generalization of the findings would be difficult due to the limitation of the scope of the present study. Nonetheless, the richness in the description of data would counter the limitation. As described by Silverman (2005), qualitative research prepares to sacrifice scope for details, which would rationalize the limitation of the study. Further study need to be undertaken using a different approach to establish the relationship between the ethical variables and corporate governance practices. Also, in order to enhance the finding multiple case study is proposed.

6. Reference

- Andrew, K. R. 1989, 'Ethics in practice', *Harvard Business Review*, September – October, pp. 99-104.
- Arjoon, S. 2005, 'Corporate governance: An ethical perspective', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol. 61, pp. 343-352.
- Caldwell, C. & Karri, R. 2005, 'Organizational governance and ethical system: a covenantal approach to building trust' *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol. 58, pp. 249-255.
- Coffee, J. C. 2003, 'What caused enron? a capsule social and economic history of the 1990's', Columbia Law and Economics working paper no. 214.
- Drennan, L. 2004, 'Ethics, governance and risk management: lesson form mirror group newspapers and barings', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol, 52, no. 3, pp. 257-266.
- Felo, A. 2001, 'Ethics program, board involvement and potential conflicts of interest in corporate governance', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol. 32, no. 2, pp. 205-218.
- Fisher, J. 2004, 'Social responsibility and ethics clarifying the concepts', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol. 52, pp. 391-400.
- Fogarty, T. 1995, 'Accountants ethics: a brief examination of neglected sociological dimension', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol.14, no. 2, pp.103-115.
- Fombrun, C. & Foss, C. 2004, 'Business ethics corporate response to scandal', *Corporate Reputation Review*, vol.7, no. 2, pp. 284-288.
- Grbich, C. 2007. Qualitative Data Analysis, Sage Publications, London.
- Hoffman, W. M., Moore, J. M. & Fredo, D.A. 1983, Corporate governance and institutionalisation ethics, Lexington Books, Toronto.
- Hofstad, G. 1980. *Culture's consequences*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications.
- Jose, A. & Thibodeaux, S. M. 1999, 'Institutionalisation of ethics: the perspective of managers', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol.22, no. 2, pp.133-143.
- Joint study by MSWG & The University of Nottingham, 2007, '*Corporate governance survey Report*', MSWG: Kuala Lumpur.
- Merriam, S. 1998. Qualitative research and case stud applications in education, Jossey-Bass Publishers, San Francisco.

Othman & Rahman

- McEwan, T. 2001, Managing values and beliefs in organizations, Pearson Education Limited, Edinburgh.
- MacKenzie, G. 2004, 'Moral sanctions ethical norms a solution to corporate governance problems, *Journal of Corporate Citizen*, September, pp. 49-61.
- Oon, O. 2004, '*Looking deeper at social responsibility*', *The Star*, MAICSA perspective column, Kuala Lumpur. November 9.
- Purcell, T. V. & Weber, J. 1978, Institutionalising corporate ethics: a case history. Special study No. 71, The presidents of American Management Association, New York.
- Quinsumbing, V .C. P. 2007, 'Human rights and ethical leadership. *World ethics and transparency forum towards greater transparency for global competitiveness*. Berjaya Times Square Hotel and Convention', Kuala Lumpur. Malaysia.
- Report on Corporate Governance*. 1999, Finance Committee on Corporate Governance, Kuala Lumpur.
- Ritchie, J. & Lewis, J. 2003, Qualitative research: a guide for social science student and researcher, Sage Publication Ltd, London.
- Sim, R. L. 1991, 'The institutionalization of organization ethics', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol.10, no. 7, pp. 493-506.
- Sullivan, J. & Shkolnikov, A. 2007, 'Business ethics: the key role of corporate governance', *The Corporate Board*, January / February.
- Soutar, G., McNeil, M. & Molster, E. 1995, 'A management perspective on business ethics', *Journal of -Business Ethics*, vol.14, no.8, pp. 603-611.
- Stevens, B. 1994, 'An analysis of corporate ethical codes studies: where do we go from here?', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol.13, pp. 63-69.
- Vitell, S. & Hildago, E. 2006, 'The impact of corporate ethical value and enforcement of ethical codes on the perceived importance of ehtics in business: a comparison of US and Spanish managers', *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol. 64, pp. 31-43.
- Weber, R. 1981, 'Institutionalising ethics into the corporations', *MSU Business Topics*, pp. 47-51.
- Wilson, S. 1979. "Explorations of the usefulness of case study evaluations", *Evaluation Quarterly*, vol. 3, pp. 446-459.
- Yin, R. K. 1994, Case study research: design and methods, 2nd ed, Sage, Beverly Hills, CA.